



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

READING IN THE ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS OF INDIANAPOLIS, V. THE READING MATERIALS

FRANKLIN BOBBITT
University of Chicago

Before one is in a position to select good reading materials for educational purposes, or to pass judgment upon those selected by others, it is necessary first to make clear definition of the purposes of the reading experience. Naturally, in the primary grades one of the ends in view is the mastering of the mechanics of reading. With good teaching of a type that is now common and with a plentiful supply of appropriate reading materials for the primary grades, this has come to be a relatively simple task. The most pressing current question is: "What is the purpose of the reading experience of intermediate and grammar grades after the simple mechanics of reading has been mastered?" The answer that we shall employ in our discussion is this: The purpose is to widen the vision and to extend the experience of the pupils beyond the confines of their narrow immediate environment. It is possible to enumerate other purposes of the reading experience all of which are valid, and none of which are inconsistent with the one here stated. It is believed, however, that the one stated should be dominant; and that if the demands of any other purpose come into conflict with it, such demands should give way to those of this dominant purpose.

Most reading on the elementary level should be for the purpose of vicarious experience. The pupil's best education comes from having a normal, varied experience rather than from the mere memorizing of abstract facts. Within the restricted environment where he lives, his best education

comes from having a great variety of active experience in his play; in his observation of men and affairs about him; in his participation in all sorts of affairs as fully as he is permitted to enter into them; in his conversation with all sorts of people; in his practical labors in shop, garden, civic and sanitary fields, etc. The best education in and for one's immediate community life is what we shall here call experiential education and not mere fact-learning from abstract books concerning that community situation.

Our profession is coming to learn that education must be experiential not only in familiarizing the pupil with his own community, but also in familiarizing him with all the world that lies beyond his narrow horizon. The best way for the individual to become acquainted with this distant world is to travel through it all, to observe men and women and their affairs in all parts of the world, and under all sorts of conditions; to enter into the labors and other activities of men in these lands; to enter for a time into the occupations involved in the great world of human vocation; to participate in the civic and social activities of various peoples, etc. In the face of present demands for world-understanding, cosmopolitan sympathies, and democratic vision of world-problems, there is no type of training that is more needed.

But the physical limitations upon such wide travel, observation, and participation are insuperable. The experience must therefore be vicarious. Those so fortunate as to have valuable types of experience must pass them on to others through the medium of language so that all may in a degree enter into the same experience. One must travel through the world and observe it in order to learn about it; but most of us must travel in imagination and observe through the eyes of others. We must participate in industry, in commerce, in war, in religion, and in civic adjustment, rightly to appreciate these things; but for most of us the major portion of the participation must be

in imagination as we enter vicariously into the experiences of others through reading spirited and well-written accounts that clearly reconstruct the situations for us.

For example, the geographical readings should be such as to permit our children imaginatively to travel through the various cities and countries and regions of the earth. Let them travel in spirit with Livingstone, and Stanley, and Roosevelt, and others, into the heart of Africa and they will have an understanding of the nature of Central Africa that can be given in no other way. Let them travel through reading with Peary to the North Pole and they will have an experiential appreciation of the nature of the polar region almost as clear as if they had been there in the flesh. Through similar spirited accounts let them vicariously enter into the life of Norway, China, Argentina, New Zealand, Canada, Mexico, etc., omitting no important region of the world, and through this reading experience they will acquire a knowledge and an appreciation of the world such as can never be obtained from the most perfect memorization of the facts supplied in our text-book geographies.

Reading of this character should aim, not at information, but at experience. The children should roam through the earth in the pages of their reading merely as a satisfying mode of living. And yet this experience does not mean any lack of information. The getting of information is a portion of the total experience. One remembers one's vital experiences. One of the reasons for demanding in our modern education a great wealth of experience rather than aiming directly at memorizing stories of verbal information is simply that there is a present need of a far greater wealth of information. This is to be arrived at, not by aiming at it directly, and at the information alone, but by aiming at it indirectly through fullness of experience. Information of this character has depth and permanency and emotional warmth. It is assimilated,

becomes a portion of one's permanent mental capital, and is not a thing quickly forgotten as soon as the examinations are over. It means, further, the development of sympathetic appreciations of human life and conditions of activity in various lands.

Children should enter not only into the experiences of present-day peoples, but also into the lives of men in the past. Just as the narrow spatial horizon should be transcended through width of geographical readings, so the narrow horizon of the present should also be transcended by entering through reading into the manifold experiences of our own and other peoples during past ages. Even more than readings concerning the present, historical reading reveals the nature of the problems confronting the peoples of the present. Nothing is quite so potent for developing sympathy and appreciation in this age of growing world-democracy. Probably there is nothing like entering into the historical experiences of the various peoples of the earth that will give to individuals the necessary intellectual outlook and the necessary sympathetic attitudes of mind. This means that the historical experience, like the geographical, must be of no narrow, circumscribed kind. As in the past, it should permit the pupils in our schools to enter into the historical experience of our own country. It should also, as in the past where the work has been well done, permit the reconstruction of the life of the Hebrews, the Greeks, the Romans, and medieval and modern Europeans. But it should go beyond this. The family of the world-democracy with which we need to be well acquainted and in full sympathy is much wider than Western Europe and the United States. There is need as well of permitting our pupils through reading to enter into the experiential past of Mexico, Canada, Brazil, Argentina, Chile, the other South

and Central American regions, Australia, New Zealand, China, Japan, India, Russia, Siberia, Turkey, the Balkan States, and the various regions of Africa.

We are not saying that the histories of these lands should be learned in the way that largely we have been having history learned in the past. We are only saying that our children should be permitted freely and fully to explore the wide and rich fields of the world's historical experience. Naturally, accounts must be selected that are full of action, that appeal to human interest upon the level of the maturity of the juvenile readers. The readings must not be didactic. They must not be dull. They must not consist too much of things that are to be learned in detail, recited upon, made subjects of examination, etc. There is a place for individual and class discussion, for teachers' stimulation and leadership; but both the experiences and the modes of conditioning and stimulating them must be quite different from the old-fashioned method of assignment of work, memorization, and repetition of lifeless facts. Here and there children born short or crushed in the struggle will be found who cannot be reached and who cannot properly enter into this vicarious experience and receive the desired benefits therefrom. The presence of weaklings is no negation of proper experience for the strong.

There are many types of needed reading. We live in a complicated economic world of agriculture, manufacture, commerce, mining, etc. Our civic problems are nowadays mainly problems of economic adjustment. A full knowledge and appreciation of, and sympathetic attitudes toward, the various economic groups in our nation seem to be indispensable for the right performance of our various civic functions. The feeling is now growing that this is a matter that should be adequately taken care of by our schools. We are, therefore, introducing into our most advanced school systems a large variety of practical occupational activities in shop, kitchen,

school garden, etc. But such practical experiences are necessarily very limited. These limitations are to be transcended through a wide reading experience relating to occupational life in the various divisions of our economic world and as these exist in the various portions of our country, and even of the entire world itself. We need readings that permit one in imagination to be a miner, for example, working in our coal mines and through such imaginative participation to have an understanding of, and sympathetic attitude toward, this large and indispensable industry. We need other readings that will permit one for a time to live on a cotton plantation, to work in the cotton mills, on our railway systems, in big department stores, in the steel mills, in furniture factories, etc. Many books are appearing that are designed to induce experience in those fields. An illustrative list is presented later.

The reading should also present a wide and full revelation of human nature and of possible and actual personal relationships, attitudes, emotional reactions, etc. This category naturally overlaps all of the others mentioned, but it appears to be needed by way of showing more clearly the place of that reading which is usually termed literature. Irving's *Sketch Book*, Dickens' *Christmas Carol* and *David Copperfield*, Defoe's *Robinson Crusoe*, etc., are not historical or geographical or industrial in any usual sense of those terms; and yet such literature has an important function to perform in the revelation of human life itself, entirely apart from space and time relations. One's experience with one's immediate associates is always relatively narrow, always partial and incomplete. One needs to read an abundance of literature that is selected for the purpose of revealing all sorts of human passions, emotions, and reactions under all sorts of circumstances.

Problems of health, physical development, sanitation, etc., are coming to be recognized as ranking in importance along

with problems of industrialism and government. Here again, in a well-protected community, one lives in a realm of relatively restricted contacts with the problems. Where the work is well done, there will be as much actual observation and practical activity on the part of the pupils as can be well introduced; but they need here, as with industry and everything else, to see the nature of the problems as they extend outward through the nation and the entire earth. No community exists in isolation, and the appreciation of the national and world-interdependencies is to be developed only through width of concrete reading. Mere fact-learning will not suffice. It fails relatively on the side of information, and leaves one cold.

And then there is the wide field of science. The individual within the narrow realm of his affairs is continually coming into contact with various aspects of nature which, for proper reaction and control, he needs to understand. But this knowledge of mechanics, of applied chemistry, of entomology, bird life, meteorology, etc., cannot be understood in any adequate degree by attention solely to the immediate manifestations. One needs to see bird life, for example, in its wider distributions rightly to appreciate that small segment which lies within one's own immediate horizon. One needs to understand the nature of the insect world, its ravages, and its benefits, as a whole, in order to appreciate the things which are occurring within the field of one's own vision. And so on with the other aspects of the field of science. As much as possible we develop the understanding through direct observation, experiment, and practical application; but after all possible is done, it has given little more than the mere alphabet of science. One needs to wander through the wide and rich fields of science and of its applications, through vicarious reading, rightly to appreciate the science aspects of the world in which he lives.

The human spirit has ever tried to transcend the limitations with which it is hedged about. Not only is there the very solid world of actuality, to various aspects of which we have referred, but there are also any number of merely imaginative worlds of myth and fancy and fairy lore in which one finds himself freed from at least a portion of his limitations. It is generally felt that this type of spiritual liberation is a desirable form of experience and that reading, therefore, should permit the pupil to traverse these free realms fairly widely. It is probable, however, that these should represent nothing more than playful interludes, and should occupy no large proportion of the time after the primary grades are passed.

Before concluding this introductory statement, I should like to make a little more clear the distinction that we have drawn between experiential education and fact-learning education, as these relate to the reading problem. Let us take, for example, Longfellow's poem *Evangeline*. If we were to select a hundred mature men and women at random who read *Evangeline* during their school days, and were to ask them to write all that they remember of the story, it is probable that the average paper would cover no more than two or three pages. That is all that they remember of the story; and yet they are men and women of average success in life. We might conclude, therefore, that since that is all they remember, those two or three pages of facts constituting the framework of the story are all that need to be taught. Instead, therefore, of having our pupils read the entire story of *Evangeline*, we might simply place a synopsis before them and have it studied, the facts memorized and recited, and an examination given, in order that ten years hence they can have a command over the same facts possessed by the men and women of this generation. It is a method of getting at the minimum essentials and having them learned. This would be an example of the fact-learning type that we employ so almost exclusively in the fields of history,

geography, science, industry, hygiene, civics, and even human nature, where we try consciously to teach it directly. It can be seen, however, that this story of *Evangeline* in two or three pages presents the barest bones only of the story. The facts have no life. There is no emotional warmth. The thing cannot be appreciated by those who have never read the full story. To get the minimum of remembered informational essentials, therefore, one must read the whole story. One must move in the current experience of the characters concerned rightly to appreciate the situations or rightly to obtain any proper command over any of the residual information. It is the same with our history, with our geography, and with the other studies enumerated. Too often we try to teach the bare bones of a subject from a brief text of minimum essentials, feeling that we are thereby accomplishing education. Such a compendium leaves our pupils cold. It does not arouse them. It does not shape them, because it is not experiential. It is just as foolish as teaching *Evangeline* through memorization of a synopsis.

In the reading of *Evangeline* it is the experience that is the principal thing. The remembering of facts years after is but the by-product, and a matter of relatively little significance. The growth-results were obtained; and most of such results were deeper than memory. The same is true of most of the historical, geographical, and other experiences referred to. The main thing is to have the experience. This will then result in proper growth along a number of lines of which one's information is but one; and apparently a thing relatively superficial and deciduous.

The bearing of this on school procedure is easily evident. It demands a wide extension of the supplementary and library reading opportunities. It demands much reading; it demands easy reading; it calls for interesting reading; it makes necessary

a type of technique of education quite different from the relatively ineffective fact-learning type.

Now what is the situation of the Indianapolis schools as regards the quantity and character of reading materials employed? There is an unusual degree of uniformity within the various buildings of the city, brought about largely, it appears, by the fact that all buildings are supplied with the same sets of required and supplementary reading materials by the central office. The titles of books that are supplied in sets large enough for class use are here shown:

GRADE I B

REQUIRED READING

	PAGES
1. <i>Child Classics Primer</i> , pp. 1-50.	50

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

Reading Slips.

Teachers should prepare supplementary lessons with the aid of the printing press.

GRADE I A

REQUIRED READING

1. <i>Child Classics Primer</i> . Complete from page 50.	38
2. <i>Child Classics First Reader</i> , pp. 1-60.	60

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

3. <i>Summer's Primer</i>	107
4. <i>Free and Treadwell's Primer</i>	112
5. <i>Blaisdell's Primer</i>	95
6. <i>Blaisdell's First Reader</i>	127
7. <i>Story Hour Primer</i>	122

661

GRADE II B

REQUIRED READING

2. <i>Child Classics First Reader</i> , complete from p. 60.	53
8. <i>Child Classics Second Reader</i> , pp. 1-54.	54

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

9. The Merrill <i>First Reader</i>	123
10. The Edson-Laing <i>Reader</i> , Book I.	118
11. <i>Folk Lore Reader</i> , Book I.	102
12. <i>Boy Blue</i>	165
13. <i>Hiawatha Primer</i>	100

715

GRADE II A

REQUIRED READING

8. <i>Child Classics Second Reader</i> . Complete from p. 54.	105
---	-----

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

14. The Edson-Laing <i>Reader</i> , Book II.	149
15. <i>Story Hour Second Reader</i>	204
16. Summer's <i>Second Reader</i>	174
17. McMurry's <i>Robinson Crusoe</i>	119
18. Johnson's <i>Book of Plays for Little Actors</i>	100
19. Aldine's <i>Second Reader</i>	176
20. Blodgett's <i>Second Reader</i>	165
21. Free and Treadwell's <i>Second Reader</i>	191

1,383

GRADE III B

REQUIRED READING

22. The <i>Howe Third Reader</i>	248
23. Andrew's <i>Seven Little Sisters</i>	119

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

24. <i>Natural Method Second Reader</i>	256
25. The Merrill <i>Second Reader</i>	184
26. Baker and Carpenter's <i>Second Year Language Reader</i>	152
27. Stevenson's <i>A Child's Garden of Verses</i>	88
28. <i>Riverside Second Reader</i>	175

1,222

GRADE III A

REQUIRED READING

29. <i>Child Classics Third Reader</i>	252
30. Jane Andrews' <i>Each and All</i>	120

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

31. The Merrill <i>Third Reader</i>	259
32. <i>Story Hour Reader</i> , Book III	236
33. Stevenson's <i>Children Classics in Dramatic Form</i> , Book III	90
34. Eggleston's <i>Stories of Great Americans for Little Americans</i>	159
35. Scudder's <i>Fables and Folk Stories</i>	198
36. Blaisdell's <i>Third Reader</i> . Latter half of term	182

 1,496

GRADE IV B

REQUIRED READING

37. Tarr and McMurry's <i>Introductory Geography</i>	254
--	-----

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

38. <i>Riverside Third Reader</i>	246
39. Baldwin's <i>Thirty Famous Stories Retold</i>	150
40. <i>Black Beauty</i> . Parts may be read at home	217
41. Bass's <i>Stories of Pioneer Life</i>	136
42. Blaisdell's <i>Fourth Reader</i>	229
33. Stevenson's <i>Children's Classics in Dramatic Form</i> , Book III	90
43. Harding's <i>Greek Gods, Heroes and Men</i> , Part I	81
44. Gordy's <i>Stories of American Explorers</i>	100

 1,503

GRADE IV A

REQUIRED READING

45. Heath's <i>Fourth Reader</i>	320
46. Carpenter's <i>North America</i> . Used in geography period	352
47. Gordy's <i>Stories of American Explorers</i>	100

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

48. Spyri's <i>Heidi</i>	363
49. Free and Treadwell's <i>Fourth Reader</i>	348
50. Baldwin's <i>Fifty Famous Stories Retold</i>	172
51. Harding's <i>Greek Gods, Heroes and Men</i> , Part III	70

 1,725

READING IN THE ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS

677

GRADE V B

REQUIRED READING

52. <i>Riverside Fourth Reader</i>	250
53. Carpenter's <i>Asia</i> . Used in geography period.....	380
54. Carpenter's <i>Australia</i> . One copy. Used in geography period...	384
55. Andrews' <i>Ten Boys</i> . Used in geography period.....	122

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

56. Norton's <i>Heart of Oak</i> , Book III. New ed.....	161
57. <i>Dog of Flanders</i>	64
58. Seton's <i>Lobo, Rag and Vixen</i>	146
59. Stevenson's <i>Children's Classics in Dramatic Form</i> , Book IV....	105
60. Church's <i>Iliad</i> . Standard School Library Edition.....	219

1,831

GRADE V A

REQUIRED READING

61. <i>Child Classics Fourth Reader</i>	275
62. Carpenter's <i>Europe</i> . Used in geography period.....	450
55. Andrews' <i>Ten Boys</i> . Used in geography period.....	122

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

63. Baker and Carpenter's <i>Fifth Year Language Reader</i> . Norse stories only, pp. 101-94.....	93
64. Longfellow's <i>Hiawatha</i>	184
65. <i>Robin Hood</i>	176
66. Ruskin's <i>King of the Golden River</i>	98
67. Stevenson's <i>Children's Classics in Dramatic Form</i> , Book IV.....	105
67. (A) <i>Lisbeth Longfrock</i> . Optional in buildings where supplied....	149

1,652

GRADE VI B

REQUIRED READING

68. Baldwin's <i>Fifth Reader</i>	192
63. Baker and Carpenter's <i>Fifth Year Language Reader</i> . Omit Norse stories, pp. 101-94.....	360
69. Carpenter's <i>South America</i> . Used in geography period.....	350
70. Carpenter's <i>Africa</i> . Used in geography period.....	332
71. Dutton's <i>Trading and Exploring</i>	240
72. Mace's <i>Primary History: Stories of Heroism</i>	198

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

73. <i>Art Literature, Fourth Reader</i>	249
74. Hawthorne's <i>Wonder Book</i>	180
75. <i>Nurnburg Stove</i> . Optional	70
76. Stockton's <i>Fanciful Tales</i>	130
77. <i>Hans Brinker</i> . Part may be read at home	275
	<hr/>
	2,576

GRADE VI A

REQUIRED READING

78. Aldine's <i>Fifth Reader</i>	452
72. Mace's <i>Primary History: Stories of Heroism</i>	198
79. Allen's <i>Industrial Reader</i>	318
80. Stickney's <i>Pioneer Indianapolis</i>	33

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

81. <i>Page, Esquire and Knight</i>	178
82. Burrough's <i>Apples</i> . Riverside Literature Series 36	15
83. Hawthorne's <i>Tanglewood Tales</i>	222
84. Knight's <i>Dramatic Reader for Upper Grades</i>	133
85. <i>Riverside Seventh Reader</i>	258
	<hr/>
	1,807

GRADE VII B

REQUIRED READING

86. Howe's <i>Fifth Reader</i> , pp. 1-178	178
87. Gordy's <i>American Beginnings in Europe</i>	165

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

88. Baldwin and Bender's <i>Eighth Reader</i>	244
89. Burrough's <i>Essays</i> . Riverside Literature Series. Optional	100
90. Dickens' <i>Christmas Carol</i>	105
91. Slocum's <i>Around the World in the Sloop Spray</i>	215
92. Warner's <i>A-Hunting of the Deer</i> . Omit introduction	80
93. Knight's <i>Dramatic Reader for Upper Grades</i>	133
	<hr/>
	1,220

GRADE VII A

REQUIRED READING

94. <i>Child Classics Fifth Reader</i> , pp. 1-170.....	170
87. Gordy's <i>American Beginnings in Europe</i>	165
95. Kendall's <i>Mark Twain's Travels in History</i>	170

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

96. Burrough's <i>Birds and Bees</i>	88
97. Longfellow's <i>Miles Standish</i>	70
98. Whittier's "Snow-Bound".....	27
99. Burt's <i>Odysseus</i>	214

904

GRADE VIII B

REQUIRED READING

94. <i>Child Classics Fifth Reader</i> , pp. 171-366.....	195
100. Longfellow's <i>Evangeline</i>	100
80. Stickney's <i>Pioneer Indianapolis</i>	33

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

101. Arnold's <i>Sohrab and Rustum</i>	28
102. Stevenson's <i>Children's Classics in Dramatic Form</i> , Book V.....	163
103. Poe's <i>Goldbug</i>	70
Washington's <i>Up from Slavery</i> . Optional.....	320
104. Moore's <i>Life of Lincoln</i>	132

1,041

GRADE VIII A

REQUIRED READING

105. Shakespeare's <i>Julius Caesar</i>	97
106. Bryant's <i>Ulysses among the Phaeacians</i>	65
107. Irving's <i>Sketch Book</i> , by Sprague.....	156
Lowell's "Commemoration Ode." Lincoln Canto only.....	2

SUPPLEMENTARY READING

108. Dickens' <i>David Copperfield's Childhood</i>	186
109. Hale's <i>Man without a Country</i>	42
110. Lowell's <i>Vision of Sir Launfal</i>	16
102. Stevenson's <i>Children's Classics in Dramatic Form</i> , Book V.....	163

727

The books read are in practically all cases confined to the assigned list. The buildings do not often seem to be supplied with any outside of those included here. They take a fair advantage of the reading opportunities placed at their disposal. The following table presents a rough approximation of the number of pages actually read by certain of the classes. It will be observed that certain of the schools read about everything that is placed at their disposal, while others cover but a minor fraction of it.

TABLE I
NUMBER OF PAGES READ PER YEAR BY CERTAIN CLASSES

Grade	Average No. Pages Read	Lowest No. Read	Highest No. Read
IA.....	580	135	1,160
IIA.....	840	220	1,500
IVA.....	800	210	1,460
VIA.....	880	310	1,925
VIIIA.....	790	300	2,340

An examination of the list shows that it conforms in very considerable measure at least with the requirements stated above that the reading should present a varied revelation of the world's affairs.

GEOGRAPHICAL READINGS

There are a considerable number of books of a geographical nature or which reveal life in different lands. They are shown in the following list:

GEOGRAPHICAL READINGS

23. *Seven Little Sisters*
30. *Each and All*
37. Tarr and McMurry's *Introductory Geography*
46. Carpenter's *Geographical Reader, North America*
48. Spyri's *Heidi*
53. Carpenter's *Asia*
54. " *Australia*
62. " *Europe*
69. " *South America*

70. *Carpenter's Africa*

79. Allen's *Industrial Studies of the United States*

91. *Around the World in the Sloop Spray*

The first two of these books are didactic fiction. A few of the stories are readable. Most of them are rather too didactic and colorless. No. 37 is a good reference book for the IV B class, but it can scarcely be satisfactory from any point of view as a source of reading experience of the type which we have tried to describe in the foregoing paragraphs. It may be good for fact-learning and discussion, but not for reading experience. No. 46 is altogether too difficult, abstract, and didactic for a fourth-grade class. In most cities it is used in the sixth or seventh grade. No. 48, though chosen as literature, is an excellent book for revealing certain aspects of life, topography, etc., in Switzerland. Nos. 53, 54, etc., must be found rather difficult for the children of these grades. There is little action and such quantities of didacticism that it is questionable whether as reading experience these books are well adapted to the needs of children of fifth and sixth grades. No. 79 is a book of modern type which probably should be read in the seventh or eighth grade. No. 91 is the only book of travels in the list.

In introducing one complete series of geographical readers there is clearly the attempt to give readings to the children which reveal all portions of the earth. This is commendable. There is, however, a wealth of geographical reading of a more modern nature which would probably be better suited to the purpose. There is needed further a larger amount of interesting travels and a larger number of stories of a literary character like *Heidi*, which reveal conditions in other lands than Switzerland.

I do not feel myself qualified to draw up a list of geographical readings for Indianapolis. The responsibility is one that rests upon the supervisory and teaching staff. The following

list is presented merely by way of indicating some of the opportunities in this field. The list goes but a little way; it might be indefinitely extended.

GEOGRAPHICAL READINGS

Chamberlain: *How We Are Clothed*.

————: *How We Are Sheltered*.

————: *How We Are Fed*.

————: *How We Travel*.

Carpenter: *How the World Is Clothed*.

————: *How the World Is Housed*.

————: *How the World Is Fed*.

Chance: *Little Folks of Many Lands*.

Shaw: *Big and Little People of Many Lands*.

George, M. M.: "Little Journeys" Series.

MacDonald and Dalrymple: "Little People Everywhere" Series.

Wade, M. H. B.: "Little Cousin" Series.

Morris: *Home Life in All Lands*.

Bullen: *Cruise of the Cachalot*.

Darwin: *Voyage of the Beagle*.

Doubleday: *Year in a Yawl*.

Semmes: *Geographical Influences in American History*.

Stockton: *Personally Conducted*.

The National Geographic Magazine.

Blaich: *Three Industrial Nations*.

Burrows: *Story of English Industry and Trade*.

Winslow: *Geography Readers*.

Perkins: *Dutch Twins, Eskimo Twins, Japanese Twins*, etc.

Finnemore, etc.: "Peeps at Many Lands" Series.

HISTORICAL READINGS

The reading list contains a very considerable number of books of a historical character. A number of the selections apparently chosen for their literary merit are historical at the same time:

HISTORICAL READINGS

34. Eggleston's *Stories of Great Americans for Little Americans*.

39. *Thirty Famous Stories Retold*.

43. Harding's *Greek Gods, Heroes and Men*.

44. Gordy's *Stories of American Explorers*.
50. *Fifty Famous Stories Retold*.
55. Andrews' *Ten Boys*.
60. Church's *Iliad*.
65. *Robin Hood*.
72. Mace's *Primary History: Stories of Heroism*.
81. Page, *Esquire and Knight*.
87. Gordy's *American Beginnings in Europe*.
97. Longfellow's *Miles Standish*.
71. Dutton's *Trading and Exploring*.
80. Stickney's *Pioneer Indianapolis*.
99. Burt's *Odysseus*.
100. Longfellow's *Evangeline*.
104. Moore's *Life of Lincoln*.
105. Shakespeare's *Julius Caesar*.

The average quality of the historical readings is considerably higher than that of the geographical. Many of the readings are good or excellent for the purpose. Among these we would mention Nos. 34, 39, 44, 50, 65, 72, 81, 87, 97, 99, 100, 104, and 105. Some of them are lacking in desirable features. No. 43 presents a mere catalogue of facts of a relatively indigestible sort. No. 55 is bloodless, anemic, historical fiction. It will do a boy no harm to read it if it appeals to him sufficiently for him to do it voluntarily; but it is so characterless as not to be likely to do him any large amount of good. Burt's *Odysseus* is excellent, but it would appear that it should be used in an earlier grade. No. 71 presents an attractive title, but it is a feeble *Ten Boys* type of treatment of ancient and modern trading nations and exploring expeditions. It does not present a straightforward narrative story of matters that need to be presented under that title.

When one looks at the list to see to what extent it presents a historical revelation of human experience in different portions of the world, one finds large and important portions of the earth that are given no historical attention at all. There is

no reading relating to ancient Hebrew life. There is only a very brief account of Greek and Roman life. There is practically nothing on modern Europe, Asia, South America, Mexico, or Australia. It is singularly lacking in biography. On the whole, it must be confessed that, while the list contains a large number of excellent books, yet it seems not to have been chosen with a clear view to the educational purposes that ought to be served by the historical readings.

By way of indicating a few further possibilities, we are here presenting a brief list of historical books or literary works with historical background that are in many quarters thought to be good for the purpose. Naturally one cannot select books from a mere list of titles. They must be examined one by one in relation to the specific situation to be met. This we have not tried to do. This list is mainly for the purpose of showing the kinds of titles we have in mind in presenting the general recommendations for enlargement and focusing upon ends of the historical reading experience. Actual selections should be made by teachers and supervisory staff.

HISTORICAL READINGS

Terry: *History Stories of Other Lands*. 6 vols.

Tappan: *World's Story*. 14 vols.

Griffis: *Romance of Discovery*.

Lang: *True Story Book*.

———: *Red True Story Book*.

Baldwin: *Old Stories of the East*.

Guerber: *Story of the Chosen People*.

Church: *Stories of the East from Herodotus*.

Guerber: *Story of the Greeks*.

Hall: *Men of Old Greece*.

———: *Four Old Greeks*.

Morris: *Historical Tales: Greek*.

Tappan: *Story of the Greek People*.

Baldwin: *Old Greek Stories*.

Church: *Stories of the Old World*.

Kingsley: *Heroes*.

- Tappan: *Story of the Roman People*.
 Guerber: *Story of the Romans*.
 Dalkeith: *Stories from Roman History*.
 Morris: *Historical Tales: Roman*.
 Hall: *Our Ancestors in Europe*.
 Tappan: *American Hero Stories*.
 Morris: *Heroes of Progress in America*.
 Guerber: *Story of the Thirteen Colonies*.
 ———: *Story of the Great Republic*.
 Coffin: *Old Times in the Colonies*.
 Scudder: *Life of Washington*.
 Baldwin: *Discovery of the Old Northwest*.
 ———: *Conquest of the Old Northwest*.
 Hart: *Source Readers in American History*.
 Barstow: *Century Readings in United States History*.
 Sutcliffe: *Robert Fulton and His Times*.
 Lighton: *Lewis and Clark Expedition*.
 Elson: *Side-Lights on American History*.
 Mowry: *Inventions and Inventors*.
 McMurry: *Pioneer History Series*.
 Eggleston: *Stories of American Life and Adventure*.
 Foote and Skinner: *Explorers and Founders of America*.
 ———: *Makers and Defenders of America*.
 Morris: *Historical Tales: American*.
 Hasbrouck: *The Boy's Parkman*.
 Parkman: *Oregon Trail*.
 ———: *Rivals for America*.
 Marshall: *Canada's Story*.
 Home: *Canada*.
 Coxhood: *Mexico*.
 Morris: *Historical Tales: Spanish-American*.
 Fletcher and Kipling: *History of England*.
 Marshall: *Island Story: A Child's History of England*.
 Morris: *Historical Tales: English*.
 Tappan: *England's Story*.
 Guerber: *Story of the English*.
 Home: *Ireland*.
 Johnson and Spencer: *Ireland's Story*.
 Mitton: *Scotland*.

- Marshall: *Scotland's Story*.
 Griffis: *Young People's History of Holland*.
 Bonner: *Child's History of France*.
 Dalkeith: *Stories from French History*.
 Guerber: *Story of France*.
 Bonner: *Little Stories of Germany*.
 Dutton: *Little Stories of Germany*.
 Marshall: *History of Germany*.
 Morris: *Historical Tales: German*.
 Van Bergen: *Story of Russia*.
 ———: *Story of China*.
 ———: *Story of Japan*.
 Marshall: *India's Story*.
 ———: *Australia's Story*.
 Morris: *Historical Tales: Russia*.
 ———: *Historical Tales: Japan and China*.
 Stevenson: *Dramatized Readings from American History*.
 Tappan: *Old World Hero Stories*.
 Mabie: *Heroes Every Child Should Know*.

INDUSTRIAL READINGS

In this complicated industrial age one would expect to find in such an extended list as that employed in Indianapolis a considerable number of books that are consciously designed to reveal the industrial situation. As a matter of fact, however, one finds in the long list but one book, Allen's *Industrial Studies of the United States*, which seems to have been chosen for this purpose. A considerable amount of industrial information is met with in the geographical readers, but much of it is there presented in such a fashion as not to be effective. This is clearly one of the aspects of the reading list that has been seriously neglected. The following short list of books shows some of the titles that might be seriously considered in choosing occupational readings:

INDUSTRIAL READINGS

- Allen: *Industrial Studies: Europe*.
 Tappan: *Maker of Many Things*.

- : *Diggers in the Earth.*
 ———: *Farmer and His Friends.*
 Doubleday: *Stories of Invention.*
 Bassett: *Story of Lumber.*
 ———: *Story of Wool.*
 Grey: *The Young Forester.*
 Mills: *Story of a Thousand-Year Pine.*
 White: *The Blazed Trail.*
 Cooke: *Day in an Iron Works.*
 ———: *Visit to a Coal Mine.*
 ———: *Visit to a Cotton-Mill.*
 ———: *Visit to a Woolen-Mill.*
 ———: *A Day with Leather-Workers.*
 Samuel: *Story of Iron.*
 ———: *Story of Gold and Silver.*
 Morgan: *Boy Electrician.*
 Moffett: *Careers of Danger and Daring.*
 Mauls: *Boy's Book of New Inventions.*
 Price: *The Land We Live In.*
 Bond: *With Men Who Do Things.*
 ———: *Pick, Shovel and Pluck.*
 Kipling: *Captain's Courageous.*
 Brooks: *Story of Cotton.*
 Williams: *Wonders of Modern Invention.*
 DuPuy: *Uncle Sam's Modern Miracles.*
 Keller and Bishop: *Commercial and Industrial Geography.*
 Mowry: *American Inventions and Inventors.*
 Bogart: *Economic History of the United States.*
 Coman: *Industrial History of the United States.*
 Dunbar: *History of Transportation in the United States.*
 Hebard: *Pathbreakers from River to Ocean.*
Popular Mechanics
 Coe: *Heroes of Everyday Life.*
 Mowry: *Captains of Industry.*
 Parton: *American Heroes and Heroism.*
 Bolton: *Lives of Girls Who Became Famous.*
 ———: *Lives of Poor Boys Who Became Famous.*

SCIENCE READINGS

The science field is also one of the seriously neglected ones.

The only nature readings are those of the following books:

NATURE READINGS

58. Seton's *Lobo, Rag and Vixen*.

82. Burrough's *Apples* (optional).

89. Burrough's *Essays* (optional).

96. Burrough's *Birds and Bees*.

It seems quite clear that these selections have been made because of their literary merit rather than for the sake of giving the children a vision of the wide fields of science. The readings are good so far as they go—though there is some question about the placing of the optional readings from John Burroughs. The problem for the city is first to make a clear definition of the purposes of having science readings; and then upon the basis of these accepted purposes to draw up a list of readings that serve the purposes. The following list is intended to present a few suggestive titles for consideration:

SCIENCE READINGS

Sharp: *A Watcher in the Woods*.

Du Puy: *Uncle Sam, Wonder Worker*.

Gould: *Mother Nature's Children*.

Weed: *Bird Life Stories*.

———: *Stories of Insect-Life*.

———: *Seed-Travellers*.

———: *Wild Flower Families*.

Morley: *Bee People*.

Morgan: *Boy, Electrician*.

Maule: *Boy's Book of New Inventions*.

Kingsley: *Madame How and Lady Why*.

Burns: *Stories of Great Inventions*.

Herrick: *Earth in Past Ages*.

Rogers: *Earth and Sky Every Child Should Know*.

Wood: *Popular Natural History*.

Holden: *The Sciences*.

———: *Real Things in Nature*.

Popular Mechanics.

Scientific American.

National Geographic Magazine.

[To be continued]